

## Addressing the impact of NHS Wales Medical and Dental Agency and Locum deployment in Wales – WHC/2017/042

### PROGRESS REPORT to reflect the activity during the period of

1<sup>st</sup> March to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2019

#### 1.0 Introduction

Welsh Government (WG) issued a Welsh Health Circular WHC/2017/042 on 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2017 “Addressing the impact of NHS Wales Medical and Dental Agency and Locum deployment in Wales”.

The Circular required Health Boards to nominate an Executive Director lead to prepare monthly progress reports for Board level scrutiny, which are subsequently forwarded to WG for information. Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Health Board (the Health Board) nominated the Executive Medical Director as their Executive lead.

This report reflects the March 2019 data following implementation of the capped rates.

The Circular required Health Boards to report on the progress of the implementation plan for capped rates, and specifically required information on the following:

1. An assessment of the effectiveness of the control framework and information about whether any changes have been made as a result of lessons learned during operation;
2. An updated risk assessment incorporating lessons learned from any practical issues which have arisen during implementation, and the ways the risks will be mitigated or managed;
3. A comparison of the actual savings compared to the projected savings and an assessment of the confidence in the accuracy of the data;
4. An anonymised list of the number of agency workers paid (later confirmed by WG to be ‘booked’) above the capped rates, including details of the number of hours/sessions they have delivered and their specialty;
5. An anonymised summary which sets out the expenditure made to each of the ten highest paid (i.e. those paid the highest hourly rate) agency workers including details of the hours/shifts worked, their specialty and length of current assignment with the organisation;
6. An anonymised summary of the longest serving agency workers i.e. those working for the longest consecutive period, including their specialty, details of the hours/shifts worked and length of assignment;
7. An anonymised summary of the number of exceptions that have been authorised for Internal Ad Hoc Locum Cover in excess of the agreed cap including the number of hours/sessions they have delivered and their specialty;
8. An anonymised summary which sets out the expenditure made to each of the ten highest paid ad hoc locum workers including details of the hours/shifts worked;
9. An anonymised summary of any individual paid more than £120 per hour or more including their specialty, details of hours/shifts worked, whether they are providing Internal Ad Hoc Locum Cover or supplied by an Agency and length of assignment for agency staff.

The Health Board (HB) is confident that the data presented for agency workers by Medacs Healthcare is accurate. There was not the same confidence in the internal ad hoc locum data as the process and systems used were bedding in. The data however has continued to improve in terms of completeness, accuracy and quality giving us now a reasonable level of confidence in its accuracy. The Health Board continues to review processes and systems and where necessary make changes to work towards 100% accurate recording of ad hoc locum data.

**2.0 An assessment of the effectiveness of the control framework and information about whether any changes have been made as a result of lessons learned during operation.**

The Units within the HB are holding weekly local scrutiny panels to consider shifts that breach before escalation to the appropriate Executive Director. There is evidence that the work of these panels is maturing.

A further scrutiny panel is held monthly which is attended by the Executive Directors. At these scrutiny panels, the Executive Directors scrutinise the decisions taken by the Delivery Units to encourage greater challenge or to ratify their work and discuss how to improve compliance with the process.

**3.0 An updated risk assessment incorporating lessons learned from any practical issues, which have arisen during implementation and the ways the risks will be mitigated or managed**

<b>Nature of risk</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Mitigating actions</b>
Recording of the Internal Ad Hoc Locum shifts	Further data is required for accurate data.	Updated information recorded and one to one training arranged for front line staff
Breaches of Internal Ad Hoc Locum Price Caps	Some departments have high vacancies and have breached capped rates to secure locums  Alternative is paying Consultants to be resident which has a much higher cost	Breaches scrutinised by each unit prior to Executive scrutiny panel. Review of recruitment options
Exclusion of GPs in the WHC	GP's approached to cover secondary locum shifts have declined as they can earn more as a locum GP.	May be beneficial to introduce a capped rate for GP's although it is accepted however that GP OOHs is very fragile at present. This requires WG approval.
Mixed Grades on Rotas	Currently grade of vacancy is paid to ad hoc locums.	Consider if the rate for the grade of the vacancy is paid

	This is proving difficult as higher grade doctors not content to receive a lower grade locum rate when sharing rotas	however, no doctor should receive less than the rate for their grade. This requires WG approval.
SAS sharing rotas with trainees	This is the same point as above however this mix of grades seems to prove more contentious as trainees consider that all on a Middle Grade rota should be paid the same rate	If the proposal above is implemented it should be monitored to establish if this also address issues for Middle Grade rotas

**4.0 A comparison of the actual savings compared to the projected savings and an assessment of the confidence in the accuracy of the data**

Please refer to Appendix 1 attached.

**5.0 An anonymised list of the number of agency workers paid above the capped rates, including details of the number of hours/sessions they have delivered and their speciality**

**5.1 Agency Workers who had assignments confirmed during March 2019 and (rates agreed after the 13.11.17) who are above the cap**

Number (from highest to lowest paid)	Hours Booked (01.3.19 to 31.3.19)	Specialty	% variance to price cap
1	23.00	General Medicine	40.14%
2	11.50	General Medicine	40.14%
3	11.50	General Medicine	40.14%
4	11.50	General Medicine	40.14%
5	11.50	General Medicine	40.14%
6	15.00	General Medicine	38.66%
7	440.00	General Medicine	13.43%
8	10.00	Accident & Emergency	66.43%
9	10.00	Accident & Emergency	66.43%
10	8.00	Accident & Emergency	66.43%
11	56.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	07.58%
12	27.00	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
13	20.00	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
14	19.00	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
15	17.00	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
16	10.00	Accident & Emergency	59.54%
17	9.50	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
18	7.00	Accident & Emergency	59.54%
19	8.00	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
20	7.50	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
21	7.50	Accident & Emergency	39.60%
22	600.00	General Medicine	34.16%
23	16.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
24	12.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
25	12.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
26	12.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
27	12.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
28	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
29	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
30	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
31	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
32	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
33	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
34	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	09.68%
35	20.00	Accident & Emergency	69.34%
36	4.00	Orthopaedics & Trauma	18.77%
37	8.00	General Medicine	21.22%
38	10.00	Accident & Emergency	48.16%
39	10.00	Accident & Emergency	48.16%
40	46.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
41	23.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
42	22.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
43	20.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
44	16.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
45	11.50	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
46	11.50	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
47	11.50	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
48	11.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%

49	10.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
50	10.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
51	46.00	General Surgery	26.22%
52	40.00	General Surgery	38.66%
53	23.00	General Surgery	26.22%
54	23.00	General Surgery	26.22%
55	12.50	General Medicine	13.79%
56	4.00	Accident & Emergency	12.60%
57	23.00	General Medicine	56.05%
58	20.00	General Medicine	56.05%
59	450.00	Cardiology	25.13%
60	420.00	Orthopaedics & Trauma	02.84%
61	16.00	General Medicine	26.22%
662	80.00	Orthopaedics & Trauma	25.81%
63	900.00	Haematology	28.06%
64	5.00	General Medicine	63.51%
65	84.00	General Surgery	26.22%
66	36.00	General Surgery	26.22%
67	30.00	General Surgery	26.22%
68	10.00	General Surgery	26.22%
69	49.50	Ear Nose & Throat	26.22%
70	10.00	Accident & Emergency	23.27%
71	9.00	Accident & Emergency	23.27%
72	8.00	Accident & Emergency	23.27%
73	23.00	Adult Psychiatry	23.27%
74	12.00	General Medicine	38.68%
75	30.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	41.42%

**5.2 New assignments sourced at cap since 13.11.17 booked in March 2019 have included:**

<b>Number (from highest to lowest paid)</b>	<b>Hours Booked (01.3.19 to 31.3.19)</b>	<b>Specialty</b>	<b>% variance to price cap</b>
1	240.00	General Medicine	00.00%
2	8.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	00.00%
3	1.00	Cardiology	-21.69%
4	16.00	General Medicine	00.00%
5	418.00	General Medicine	00.00%
6	10.00	Accident & Emergency	00.00%
7	300.00	Old Age Psychiatry	00.00%
8	1,050.00	Haematology	-13.99%
9	200.00	Cardiology	-21.69%
10	60.00	Orthopaedics & Trauma	-35.13%
11	750.00	Adult Psychiatry	00.00%
12	200.00	Haematology	-15.84%
13	150.00	Adult Psychiatry	00.00%

**5.3 Summary of hours booked in March 2019**

Hours booked at Cap	3,403.00
Hours booked above Cap	7,472.00
Extensions to bookings made prior to 13.11.17 above Cap	0.00

Hours Job Extensions - 4,746.00

Hours New Bookings - 2,726.00

**6.0 An anonymised summary which sets out the expenditure made to each of the ten highest paid (i.e. those paid the highest hourly rate) agency workers including details of the hours/shifts booked, their specialty and length of current assignment with the organisation**

Number (from highest to lowest paid)	Total Cost hourly rate	Hours Booked (01.3.19 to 31.3.19)	Specialty	Length of current assignment	Expenditure
1	£124.50	900.00	Haematology	11 <sup>th</sup> March 2019 – 31 <sup>st</sup> August 2019	£112,050.00
2	£121.65	450.00	Cardiology	5 <sup>th</sup> March 2019 – 26 <sup>th</sup> March 2019	£54,742.50
3	£110.28	440.00	General Medicine	29 <sup>th</sup> May 2019 – 16 <sup>th</sup> August 2019	£48,523.20
4	£104.59	56.00	Paediatrics & Neonates	16 <sup>th</sup> – 19 <sup>th</sup> April 2019	£5,857.04
5	£99.98	420.00	Trauma & Orthopaedics	1 <sup>st</sup> April 2019 – 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2019	£41,991.60
6	£97.22	750.00	Adult Psychiatry	4 <sup>th</sup> February 2019 – 28 <sup>th</sup> June 2019	£72,915.00
7	£96.61	20.00	Accident & Emergency	27 <sup>th</sup> – 29 <sup>th</sup> November 2019	£1,932.20
8	£94.95	10.00	Accident & Emergency	18 <sup>th</sup> March 2019	£949.50
9	£91.02	10.00	Accident & Emergency	23 <sup>rd</sup> March 2019	£910.20
10	£83.62	1,050.00	Haematology	18 <sup>th</sup> February 2019 – 23 <sup>rd</sup> August 2019	£87,801.00

**7.0 An anonymised summary of the longest serving agency workers i.e. those working for the longest consecutive period, including their specialty, details of the hours/shifts worked and length of assignment**

A list of the Top 10 have been presented.

Number (from longest consecutive period)	Specialty	Aggregate of Hours worked	Length of assignment
1	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	10,860	29.12.18 – 31.3.19
2	Paediatrics & Neonates	10,510	28.1.19 – 30.3.19
3	Haematology	2,010	18.2.19 – 23.8.19
4	Rehabilitation	4,860	1.2.19 – 30.4.19
5	Trauma & Orthopaedics	3,660	21.12.18 – 2.8.19
6	Oncology	3,510	11.2.19 – 28.6.19
7	Adult Psychiatry	3,510	4.6.19 – 28.6.19
8	Adult Psychiatry	3,310	1.2.19 – 28.6.19
9	Obstetrics & Gynaecology	2,160	1.4.19 – 2.6.19
10	Adult Psychiatry	2,010	8.10.18 – 12.4.19

**8.0 An anonymised summary of the number of exceptions that have been authorised for Internal Ad Hoc Locum Cover in excess of the agreed cap including the number of hours/sessions they have delivered and their specialty**

Breached capped Rate	Service	No. of Bookings	Hours Worked	Percentage of Compliance*
<b>Yes</b>	Accident & Emergency	36	324.95	26.87%
	Anaesthetics	62	530.50	33.33%
	General Medicine	44	617.00	54.32%
	Radiology	1	16.00	12.5%
	Surgery	11	271.50	11.34%
<b>No</b>	Accident & Emergency	98	914.75	73.13%
	Anaesthetics	124	1314.00	66.67%
	Dental	24	709.87	100%
	General Medicine	37	525.75	45.68%
	Obstetrics	15	241.23	100%
	Paediatrics	27	489.12	100%
	Psychiatry	43	468.00	100%
	Radiology	7	87.06	87.5%
	Surgery	86	1511.00	88.66%

\*Percentage of the total returns in that specialty

**9.0 An anonymised summary, which sets out the expenditure made to each of the highest paid ad hoc locum workers including details of the hours/shifts worked**

No.	Specialty	Grade	Unit	Hrs Booked	Avg Hourly Rate	Sum of Total Cost
1	Cardiac	Consultant	Morrison	11.25	333.33	£3,749.96
2	Cardiac	Consultant	Morrison	22.50	333.33	£7,499.93
3	Cardiac	Consultant	Morrison	18.75	333.33	£6,249.94
4	Cardiac	Consultant	Morrison	15.00	333.33	£4,999.95
5	A&E	Consultant	POW	10.00	188.93	£1,889.30
6	A&E	Consultant	POW	4.25	188.93	£802.95
7	A&E	Consultant	Morrison	20.00	160.00	£3,200.00
8	A&E	Consultant	Morrison	10.00	160.00	£1,600.00
9	A&E	Consultant	Morrison	10.00	160.00	£1,600.00
10	Radiology	ST3+	POW	16.00	156.00	£2,496.00



There were 21 Consultants with an hourly rate of £144.75 with a total cost of £43,596.75 attributed to Anaesthetics in Morriston/Singleton Hospitals and 5 Consultants with an hourly rate of £154.40 with a total cost of £8,106.00 attributed to Anaesthetics Princess of Wales/Neath Port Talbot.

**Please note:**

In 2011 Welsh Government brought in an additional sessional payment guide for Orthopaedic Services and currently this stands at £585 per session and therefore although a breach of capped rate is in line with the T&Cs.

The Amendment to the National Consultant Contract in Wales paragraph 3.8 also states, *“In exceptional circumstances where a Consultant is requested and agrees to be immediately available i.e. resident on call, this will be remunerated at three times the sessional payment at Point 6 of the Consultant salary scale”*, this would equate to £566 a session giving an hourly rate of £151.15, this is a breach of the capped rate but in line with the T&Cs.

**10.0 An anonymised summary of any individual paid more than £120 per hour or more including their specialty, details of hours/shifts worked, whether they are providing Internal Ad Hoc Locum Cover or supplied by and Agency and length of assignment for agency staff.**

Due to the numbers please refer to Appendix 4 attached for March 2019 data.

**11.0 Compliance with the CCS framework to procure agency workers**

Number of Drs Booked	Number Drs Booked MasterVend	Number Drs Booked outside MasterVend	Number Drs booked outside CCS Framework
33	33	0	0

ABOVE CAP – 20, 60.60%

AT / BELOW CAP – 13, 39.40%

**Other useful Key Statistics**

**Agency**

Attached as Appendix 2 is the spreadsheet relating to Agency shifts. The total number of external agency assignments booked in March was 88. 13 (14.77%) of these were paid at the capped rate or below the cap. 100% of these assignments were booked to cover vacancies. The cost attributed to engaging external agency doctors for March 2019 was £645,059 a reduction from February 2019. Morriston Hospital has utilised the greatest spend of agency doctors bookings at 40 assignments at a cost of £286,896. Singleton Hospital utilised 11 assignments at a cost of £182,591, followed by Mental Health 17 assignments at a cost of £116,843. Neath Port Talbot also booked 2 assignments with a related cost of £30,110.

## **Ad hoc Locums**

Attached as Appendix 3 is the spreadsheet relating to internal ad hoc locum shifts. In March 2019, of the 615 ad hoc locum booked assignments, (75%) were paid at or below the capped rate. The value of internal ad hoc locum usage was £559,649.04 (includes on costs). Morriston utilised the greatest number of bookings: 327 with 99 breaches of the cap. POWH booked 120 with 27 breaches. Singleton utilised 107 with 22 breaches of the cap, of which 3 breaches were attributed to Anaesthetics Morriston. Neath Port Talbot booked 18 with 6 breaches of the cap rate associated to Anaesthetics (funded by POWH); Mental Health 43 bookings with no breaches of the capped rate.

### **13.0 Conclusion**

The HB continues to work hard in embedding the process. There is high confidence in the Medacs data. A substantial amount of work has been undertaken to improve the quality of the internal ad hoc locum data. There is growing evidence that external supply is being affected due to market forces. It is also thought that the inability to pay accommodation and travel is having a negative impact on supply. It is critical therefore given that this is now the fifteenth report that the HB and NHS Wales begin to look for alternative solutions to improve the supply of doctors in a number of specialties to reduce the reliance on Agency or ad hoc locum doctors. The HB would also welcome feedback from Welsh Government on the data and reports submitted so far.

**Prepared by: Dr Richard Evans**

**(Executive Director Lead for WHC/2017/042)**