



**GIG**  
CYMRU  
**NHS**  
WALES

Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol  
Abertawe Bro Morgannwg  
University Health Board



Meeting Date	7 <sup>th</sup> June 2018	Agenda Item	8a
Report Title	<b>Cost Efficiencies of Ward Hostesses</b>		
Report Author	Wendy Sunderland-Evans, Corporate Safeguarding Team		
Report Sponsor	Cathy Dowling, Interim Deputy Director of Nursing and Patient Experience		
Presented by	Angela Hopkins, Interim Director of Nursing and Patient Experience		
Freedom of Information	Open		
Purpose of the Report	The paper sets out to describe cost efficiencies based on a three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board from 2018 – 2021. This was requested at the Quality and Safety Committee in June 2017.		
Key Issues	<p>The Wales Audit Office (WAO) (2010) recommended that the Health Board needed to standardise the Health Board's ward based catering services and improve patient experience. This recommendation was repeated by the WAO (2016). To date, due to financial constraints, 49 wards across Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals do not have a daily ward hostess service to cover all patient meal servings.</p> <p>Key issues include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Statutory requirement for nursing staff to undertake Level 1 Food Hygiene training and on-going compliance is risk for the Health Board (score of 4 on the Health Board risk register). On-going non-compliance places the Health Board at financial risk of being fined by the Environmental Health Department</li> <li>• In 2016, Environmental Health Officers observed food practices on randomly chosen wards during Food Hygiene Rating inspections on-site; in Princess of Wales the Food Hygiene rating has reduced from 5 (the highest score) to 3</li> <li>• A Band 5 nurse vacancy rate of 315 WTE is reported for May 2018. The effect of nursing vacancies within the Health Board is compounded where nursing staff have to undertake ward hostess duties at meal times; this may have an adverse impact on the implementation of the Nurse Staffing</li> </ul>		

	(Wales) Act 2016 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Wards with limited or no ward hostess service may delay the Health Board meeting the WG reduced food waste target of 5% (currently 8%).</li> </ul>			
<b>Specific Action Required</b> <i>(please ✓ one only)</i>	<b>Information</b>	<b>Discussion</b>	<b>Assurance</b>	<b>Approval</b>
	x			
<b>Recommendations</b>	Members are asked to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Note the contents of this paper.</li> </ul>			

# **Cost efficiencies with a three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board**

## **1.0 INTRODUCTION**

The paper sets out to describe cost efficiencies based on a three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board from 2018 – 2021. This was requested at the Quality and Safety Committee in June 2017.

## **2.0 BACKGROUND**

Singleton, Neath Port Talbot, Cefn Coed and Glanrhyd Hospitals have a full ward hostess service in place. A full ward hostess service serves three meals a day over seven days a week. Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals have a limited ward hostess on some wards partly funded by support services and nursing services. Nursing services provide £0.5 million to fund this current limited ward hostess service. These arrangements result in inequity in food service provision for in-patients across the Health Board.

*The All Wales Nutrition and Catering Standards for Food and Fluid Provision for Hospital Inpatients* (Welsh Government (WG), 2011) highlights the important role that catering staff play in ensuring a coordinated approach to make sure patients are provided with a first class food service. Hospital food is an essential part of in-patient care. There are approximately 2.4 million in-patient meals served on an annual basis across the Health Board. Appetising food will encourage patients to eat well and must contain the nutrients they need to recover from illness or surgery. An important aspect of the ward hostess role is the regular provision of fluids to ensure patients are well hydrated.

As far back as 2010, the Wales Audit Office (WAO) (2010) recommended that more needed to be done to standardise the Health Board's ward based catering services and improve patient experience. The WAO (2010) recognised the Singleton ward hostess model as an example of best practice. This seven day service of 10.75 ward hostess hours on a daily basis covers all patient meal servings.

The WAO (2010) acknowledged that the Health Board needed to consider the different options within the resources available. To date however, a total of 49 wards across Morriston and Princess of Wales still do not have a full ward hostess service in place. To replicate this full service in the 49 wards in Princess of Wales and Morriston will require the recruitment of 120.54 whole time equivalent (WTE) Band 2 staff.

In previous years a number of papers have been prepared for the Board by the Head of Support Services which explore the costs and benefits of introducing a ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals. This has resulted in

Board approval and inclusion in IMTP plans. Proposals have been agreed in principle on three occasions, however, it has not been possible to progress with implementation due to limited availability of funding. A phased approach to implementation has been suggested by the Board.

In the 49 wards which do not have a full ward hostess service, nursing staff undertake the ward hostess duties, i.e. serve patient meals. In this situation, there is a statutory requirement that nursing staff must complete Level 1 Food Hygiene training. A large number of nurses have not completed this training. This omission remains on the Health Board's risk register (score: 4).

The external drivers to the Health Board which compel the introduction of the ward hostess service include the Welsh Audit Office, Environmental Health Departments, Welsh Government and Food Waste targets. The demands are to improve efficiency, reduce cost and standardise the in-patient food provision service all which are difficult to achieve in the current situation.

The following in-patient food service systems are in operation:

#### Ward hostess service

These are ward based caterers who undertake all catering related tasks at ward level such as discussing menu and dietary options with patients, serving beverages, selecting, regenerating and serving patient meals (breakfast, lunch and supper) and having overall responsibility for the ward kitchen.

#### Ward housekeeper / hostess service

This role has been introduced in 13 wards in Morriston which is a hybrid role focusing on both ward hostess and nursing tasks. This role includes a combination of ward hostess and nursing duties which are determined at ward level by the Ward Sister.

#### Nursing staff

Nursing staff order and serve meals to patients. Delivery of meals is normally undertaken by either kitchen or portering staff. This has an adverse impact on the availability of nursing hours to provide nursing care. A Workforce paper (November 2017) reported a nurse vacancy of 482 WTE across the Health Board. The vacancy rate in:

- Morriston is 23% (110 WTE)
- Princess of Wales is 14% (68 WTE).

## 2.1 Current ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals

### 2.1.1 Morriston Hospital

Only three wards in Morriston Hospital have a full seven day ward hostess service which covers all mealtimes which is funded by support services:

- Ty Olwen
- Oakwood
- Acute Medical Assessment Unit East.

Table 1 illustrates the wide variation of ward hostess models in Morriston with different allocation of hours with shared funding arrangements between support and nursing services resulting in an inconsistent service.

**Table 1. Ward hostess service in Morriston Hospital**

Wards	5 day service	7 day service	Weekly ward hostess hours	Ward house-keeper/ hostess	Funded by support services	Funded by nursing and support services	Funded by nursing services
Ty Olwen, Oakwood, AMAU East		✓	73.5		✓		
C, D, F, S, Gower, Anglesey, Cardigan	✓			37.5		✓	
R	✓			30			✓
H, T, V, G	✓			25 - 30			✓
AMAU West	✓		37.5			✓	

The remaining 16 wards (32 in total) in Morriston have no ward hostess service.

## 2.1.2 Princess of Wales Hospital

In 2014, money from nursing vacancies funded a permanent full seven day ward hostess service (Band 2) on Ward 2.

**Table 2. Ward hostess service in Princess of Wales Hospital**

Wards	5 day service	7 day service	Weekly ward hostess hours	Funded by support services	Funded by nursing and support services	Funded by nursing services
2		✓	73.5			✓
18, 19, 20		✓	73.5 (recent months this has been reduced)	✓ (agreed over spend)		

The remaining 20 wards do not have a ward hostess service.

## 2.2 Statutory Food Hygiene training

Food Hygiene training is a statutory requirement in food service to ensure food safety. The level of Food Hygiene training that staff must complete is dependent on their involvement in food handling.

### Level 1 Food Hygiene Training

The Environmental Health Officer has indicated that nursing staff have training commensurate to their food handling duties. Level 1 Food Hygiene training meets this requirement as nursing staff do not cook and prepare food. The WAO (2016) recommended that ward staff complete the e-learning package for Level 1 Food Hygiene training introduced in 2011. The *Food Safety Awareness* e-learning module has been available on ESR since May 2017 (30 minutes to complete). It has been confirmed that this training material covers the learning and competencies required for Level 1 Food Hygiene training. Refresher training must be completed every three years.

There has been a delay in nursing staff completing Level 1 Food Hygiene training in both Princess of Wales and Morriston. The Welsh Audit Office (2016) acknowledged that the roll out of food hygiene training for nurses across the Health Board is challenging but reinforced the need for this to ensure food safety. In 2016 in Princess of Wales, the Food Hygiene rating was reduced from 5 (the highest score) to 3. This was based on ward based observations during an inspection which highlighted the difference in food safety controls between wards which had a ward hostess and those which did not. On-going failure for the Health Board to comply with statutory food hygiene poses a risk to the Health Board of being fined. This is

recorded on the Health Board's risk register and due to control measures put in place scores 4. Current records from ESR show that the completion rate by nursing staff for Level 1 Food Hygiene training remains low.

### Level 2 Food Hygiene training

Ward hostesses must complete face to face Level 2 Food Hygiene training. This higher level of training is required as food handling duties include food collection, preparation and regeneration. Refresher training is required every three years.

## **2.3 Impact on nursing care**

Common to the wards with a limited or no ward hostess service is the demand for nursing hours which removes nurses from providing direct nursing care:

- In the 36 wards (Morriston 16 wards, Princess of Wales 20 wards) where there is no ward hostess service, meals are served by nursing staff
- In the five day service model, meals are served by nursing staff over the weekend
- Where the five day allocation of ward hostess hours does not cover all mealtimes (13 wards in Morriston), nursing staff serve one meal per day a Monday to Friday basis, i.e. breakfast or supper.

A Band 5 nurse vacancy rate of 351 WTE is reported in May 2018. The challenge of nursing recruitment and retention is recognised on a national basis. The effect of nursing vacancies within the Health Board is compounded where nursing staff have to undertake ward hostess duties at meal times; this may have an adverse impact on the implementation of the Nurse Staffing (Wales) Act 2016.

If a phased approach to implementing a ward hostess service is agreed, wards with the highest number of nurse vacancies can be highlighted as priority areas to commence the ward hostess service. This will increase the number of nursing hours available to provide direct patient care.

### **2.3.1 Estimated cost of nursing hours in undertaking catering duties**

In wards which do not have a full seven day ward hostess service, there is an "unseen" cost for nursing hours which are required to serve patient meals. In calculating the "unseen" cost of nursing hours, it has been agreed to base the cost on one Band 5 at mid pay scale plus on costs (£16.16 per hour; the cost of a ward hostess Band 2 top pay band plus on costs is £13.71 per hour). It is felt that this is a reasonable estimation given that some nurses undertaking ward hostess duties will be on a lesser pay banding whilst other nurses maybe on a higher pay banding. The estimated cost is based on one hour for each meal serving:

On an annual basis the current estimated “unseen” cost of nursing hours within Morriston and Princess of Wales is £755,447 (46,748 hours) (see appendix 1, page 23):

- Morriston: £402,513 (24,908 hours)
- Princess of Wales £352,934 (21,840 hours).

## **2.4 Food waste**

The current food waste from in-patient meals is 8% which is a financial loss of £151,258 for the Health Board. WG have reduced the food waste target to 5% which would reduce the financial loss to £95,536. This equates to a cost saving of £55,722.

The ward hostess assists patients with their choice of menu so it is anticipated that this will contribute to the Health Board achieving the reduced 5% food waste target from the current 8%. Examples of patient feedback illustrate the positive impact the ward hostess service has on patient experience of the in-patient food service.

## **2.5 Patient experience**

The WAO (2010) recognised the Singleton ward hostess model as an example of best practice. The WAO (2016) report describes their visit to the Health Board in 2015. They found that the Health Board was not meeting the All Wales Nutrition Standards in providing patients with seven drinks rounds and three water jug changes per day. The WAO (2016) noted a positive difference in wards supported by a ward hostess with the ward hostess being well placed for helping ensure patients can access food, snacks and beverages throughout the day. The WAO (2016) also noted that the monthly catering experience surveys identify positive feedback on hotel service staff in the wards supported by a ward hostess.

Examples of patient feedback illustrate the positive impact the ward hostess service has on patient experience of the in-patient food service and how this plays an important factor in reducing food waste:

*“The ward hostess' were extremely friendly and helpful.”*

*“ ....the ward hostess helped my mum when she wouldn't eat to get her eating.”*

*“Hostess very good, food good and plenty of tea and coffee.”*

*“Staff very helpful, very clean and the hostess very cheerful and plenty of tea/coffee. A pleasant stay regardless of my illness.”*

*“..... the ward hostess is very caring and ensures you are catered for to the best of her abilities especially with the current kitchen restrictions.”*

*“..... exceptional from hostess and domestic very good. Hot chocolate is lovely”.*



*“The afternoon hostess serving the food was very kind and friendly*

#### **Example of best practice**

At the time of the Welsh Audit Office visit in 2015, the ward hostess in Morriston Acute Medical Assessment Unit had recently received a Health Board award for support services acknowledging her work supporting patients’ nutritional needs and dietary preferences. Food courses were served separately which helped maintain temperature and made food more appetising and good organisation of the mealtime service. Patients were fully prepared to receive their meal, nurses were available in patient areas to support those who needed help in a calm atmosphere conducive to eating.

## **2.6 Salary cost for implementing a ward hostess service across the Health Board**

Previous papers submitted to the Board have illustrated the salary cost for two options based on a Band 2 at top pay scale plus on costs (£13.71 per hour). Table 3 shows the salary cost to implement a ward hostess service in the 49 Wards:

- Option 1: 10.75 hours per day over seven days / all meals served by a ward hostess
- Option 2: 7 hours per day over seven days / two meals a day served by a ward hostess.

**Table 3. Salary cost based on 120.54 WTE, Band 2 top pay band**

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>Morriston: 29 wards</b>	<b>Princess of Wales: 20 wards</b>	<b>Total: 49 wards</b>
Option 1:	£1,854,716	£1,279,114	<b>£3,133,830</b>
Option 2	£1,207,722	£832,911	<b>£2,040,633</b>

(See appendix 2, page 24 which illustrates the salary cost over a three year phased implementation).

Although the cost of Option 2 appears less, the disadvantage is that one meal per day is served by nursing staff which is associated with the earlier described “unseen” cost of nursing hours and prevents nurses from providing direct patient care (Band 5 at mid pay scale plus on costs £16.16 per hour).

## 2.8 Three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service

Due to the expense of implementing a full ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales, the Board have suggested a phased approach. This can take advantage of any associated cost benefit which can be re-invested over the three years to reduce the overall cost of implementation.

### 2.8.1 Additional cost with phased implementation

#### Level 2 Food Hygiene training requirements

All newly appointed ward hostesses are required to complete the Level 2 Food Hygiene training estimated to cost **£5000**. On average this will cost £1667 on an annual basis over the three years.

#### Uniforms

There will be a large number of part time staff making up the 120.54 WTE, therefore a large number of uniforms will be required which is estimated at **£11,000**. On average this will cost £3,667 on an annual basis over the three years.

### 2.8.2 Cost benefit

#### Projected cost savings with reduce food waste

It is envisaged that a full ward hostess service will reduce the Health Board food wastage (see appendix 3, page 25).

**Table 4. Projected cost savings with reduced food waste**

Current	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
8%	7% waste	5% waste	5% waste
	£6,176	£38,181	£56,693

#### Pilot ward hostess service in Princess of Wales Hospital

Previous reference has been made to the agreed £200K overspend which funds the pilot ward hostess service in wards 18, 19 and 20. This equates to £66,666 per ward. The cost savings by replacing the pilot service with permanent staff within the support services are listed in Table 6.

**Table 5. Cost savings with replacing pilot service in Princess of Wales Hospital with permanent catering staff**

	Salary cost per ward	Saving per ward if permanent staff appointed	Cost savings in permanently funding 3 wards each year
<b>Option 1</b> 10.75 hours per day	£63,955.74	£2,710.92	£8,132.76
<b>Option 2</b> 7 hours per day	£41,645.00	£25,021.66	£75,064.98

Option 2 appears to give the greater cost saving. Again, it is important to note that nursing staff serve one meal per day seven days a week with Option 2. This is associated with an “unseen” nursing cost and takes nurses away from providing direct patient care.

### **Ward closure in Singleton Hospital**

Two ward closures are taking place in Singleton Hospital. The support services have proposed that:

- The money saved from catering services in Ward 10 is transferred to meet the catering shortfall in Singleton Assessment Unit
- The money saved from Ward 20 is transferred to fund a ward hostess service in Morriston or Princess of Wales Hospitals, i.e. £63,956.

## 2.9 Cost of phased implementation with projected cost savings deducted

**Table 6. Morriston Hospital** (see appendix 4, pages 26 - 27)

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>2018 -19</b>	<b>2019 - 20</b>	<b>2020 - 21</b>
Option 1 10.75 hours per day	£511,110	£1,132,480	£1,760,467
Option 2 7 hours per day	£310,320	£708,592	£1,113,478
Number of wards	9 wards	10 wards (19 in total)	10 wards (29 in total)

**Table 7. Princess of Wales Hospital** (see appendix 5, pages 28 - 30)

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>2018 -19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 -21</b>
Option 1 10.75 hours per day	£439,137	£873,331	£1,249,797
Option 2 7 hours per day	£216,034	£494,057	£736,662
Number of wards	7 wards	7 wards (14 in total)	6 wards (20 in total)

**Table 8. Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospital** (see appendix 6, page 31)

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>2018 -19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020-21</b>
Option 1 10.75 hours per day	£950,247	£2,005,811	£3,010,264
Option 2 7 hours per day	£526,355	£1,202,649	£1,850,140
Number of wards	16 wards	33 wards	49 wards

**Table 9. Summary of advantages and disadvantages of options available**

<b>Advantages</b>	<b>No change</b>	<b>Option 1</b>	<b>Option 2</b>
In the short term a less expensive model.	✓		✓
Nursing staff will not have to complete the statutory Level 1 Food Hygiene training; the risk of non-compliance for the Health Board will be removed.		✓	
Patient experience of nutrition and hydration is enhanced; this is a positive factor for the Health Board in meeting the All Wales Patient and Nutrition Standards.		✓	
Allows nurses to provide direct patient care; this supports the Health Board in meeting the requirements of the Nurse Staffing (Wales) Act (2016).		✓	
The current “unseen” estimated annual cost of nursing hours to serve patient meals in Morriston and Princess of Wales will cease: £755,447 (46,748 hours)		✓	
There is a cost benefit in converting the pilot ward hostess service in Princess of Wales (wards 18, 19, 20); current agreed overspend is £200K.		✓	
Will help reduce the Health Board food waste of 8% to meet the WG food waste target of 5%; this will result in a financial cost saving for the Health Board		✓	✓
<b>Disadvantages</b>	<b>No change</b>	<b>Option 1</b>	<b>Option 2</b>
In the short term a more expensive model.		✓	
The requirement for nursing staff to complete the statutory Level 1 Food Hygiene training will continue; non-compliance poses a financial risk to the Health Board.	✓		✓
Patient experience of nutrition and hydration may be reduced if there are less ward hostess hours; this may have an adverse effect for the Health Board in meeting the All Wales Patient and Nutrition Standards	✓		✓
Takes nurses away from providing direct patient care. With the high nursing vacancy rate in Morriston and Princess of Wales this may have an adverse effect for the Health Board in meeting the requirements of the Nurse Staffing (Wales) Act (2016)	✓		✓
The current “unseen” estimated annual cost of nursing hours to serve patient meals in Morriston and Princess of Wales although reduced in Option 2 will continue after full implementation	✓		✓
There may be a delay in the Health Board reducing the current food waste of 8% to meet the WG food waste target of 5%; financial loss to the Health Board will continue.	✓		✓

## 2.10 Apprenticeship

The support services in Princess of Wales are in the process of submitting a proposal to appoint apprentice ward hostesses.

Apprentices will:

- Usually be 16-24 years old but can be any age
- Undertake a qualification framework relevant to their area
- Be on a fixed term 12 month contract (depending on the framework they are enrolled on) and have all the same terms and conditions as any other member of staff :
  - Hours of work anything over 16.5 hours
  - Same annual leave and sickness policies apply

Apprentices salary funding will come from the support services at a reduced rate.

Age	Apprentice	Under 18	18 to 20	21 to 24	24+
April 2017 (current rate)	£3.50	£4.05	£5.60	£7.05	£7.50

### Cost to support services

- First 12 months all apprentices, regardless of age are paid £3.50 per hour = £6,825 per annum
- There is no obligation to keep them on after this first 12 months
- If they are successful they can either:
  - Apply for existing vacancy
  - Move to a higher level apprenticeship
  - After the initial 12 months, their rate of pay will increase to national minimum wage for their age.

### **3.0 GOVERNANCE AND RISK ISSUES**

#### **Key issues identified with current in-patient food service provision**

- The Hospital Catering and Patient Nutrition Follow up Review by the WAO Office in 2015 recommends the introduction of a ward hostess service in order to standardise in-patient food service provision across the Health Board
- Compliance of All Wales Patient and Nutrition Standards on wards within Princess of Wales is variable as practice varies widely between wards
- The statutory requirement for nursing staff to undertake Level 1 Food Hygiene training and on-going compliance is a concern for the Health Board. Control measures put in place has reduced the risk score to 4 on Health Board risk register. On –going non-compliance places the Health Board at financial risk of being fined by the Environmental Health Department
- In 2016, Environmental Health Officers observed food practices on randomly chosen wards during Food Hygiene Rating inspections on-site; in Princess of Wales the Food Hygiene rating has reduced from 5 (the highest score) to 3
- A Band 5 nurse vacancy rate of 315 WTE is reported for May 2018. The challenge of nursing recruitment and retention is recognised on a national basis. The effect of nursing vacancies within the Health Board is compounded where nursing staff have to undertake ward hostess duties at meal times; this may have an adverse impact on the implementation of the Nurse Staffing (Wales) Act 2016
- The cost of current service in Princess of Wales is approximately £200K per annum; this cost is higher than it could be because of the lack of permanent arrangements (staff are “temporarily assigned” via rolling contracts to wards 18, 19, and 20 since April 2014)
- The additional problem of supply and recruitment of agency staff in Princess of Wales to cover the ward hostess service in wards 18, 19 and 20 has resulted in periods of a shortfall of hours to sustain the full seven day ward hostess service. Nursing staff are required to serve patient meals during these times which removes them from providing direct patient care
- Wards with limited or no ward hostess service may delay the Health Board meeting the WG reduced food waste target of 5% (currently 8%).

### **4.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

Allocation of money is required to implement a three year phased ward hostess service. The cost efficiencies in this paper illustrate how cost savings can be re-invested to reduce the on-going cost of implementing a ward hostess service with a phased approach from 2018 – 2021. These cost savings originate from:

- Implementation of a ward hostess service, i.e. reduced cost of food wastage and reduced cost if the pilot ward hostess service in the three wards in Princess of Wales become permanent
- Closure of Ward 20 in Singleton where the cost saving of a full ward hostess service will fund a ward hostess service in one of the wards in Morriston or Princess of Wales (in this paper Singleton has been chosen).

The paper highlights the “unseen” estimated annual nursing costs in wards where nursing staff have to serve patient meals when no ward hostess service is available.

#### **4.1 Choices available**

A summary of advantages and disadvantages are listed in Table 9 (see page 13). These choices include no change to the current ward hostess service, to implement Option 1 or Option 2.

##### **No change**

A choice is to make no change to the ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals. This however does not meet WAO (2010) and WAO (2016) recommendations to standardise the ward hostess service across the Health Board.

##### **Option 1**

The Option 1 ward hostess model is the preferred option as this is a full ward hostess service of 10.75 hours per day over seven days a week. This model has been in place in Singleton for many years and was highlighted by the WAO (2010) as an example of best practice.

**Table 10. Cost of phased implementation with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>2018 -19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020-21</b>
Option 1 10.75 hours per day	£950,247	£2,005,811	£3,010,264
Number of wards	16 wards	33 wards	49 wards

Although Option 1 appears a more expensive option, by year 3, all the estimated “unseen” nursing costs associated with nursing staff having to serve patient meals will cease.



## **Option 2**

The Option 2 ward hostess model is not a full ward hostess service. Although a served by nursing staff on a daily basis. Although Option 2 appears a less expensive option, the “unseen” estimated nursing costs associated with nursing staff having to serve patient meals will continue after full implementation.

**Table 11. Cost of phased implementation with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>7 day service</b>	<b>2018 -19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020-21</b>
Option 2 7 hours per day	£526,354	£1,202,649	£1,850,140
Number of wards	16 wards	33 wards	49 wards

## **4.2 Apprenticeship**

The support services in Princess of Wales are in the process of submitting a proposal to appoint apprentice ward hostesses which will be funded by support services. If approved, the Board will need to consider how this will fit into plans for implementing an improved ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals.

## **4.3 Allocation of nurse funding**

Nursing services currently fund £0.5 million which supports the current limited ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales. Consideration must be given to the arrangements for this funding if a three year phased implementation is agreed.

## **5.0 RECOMMENDATION**

It is a priority to provide an equitable and high quality ward service hostess across the Health Board as this was recommended by the WAO (2010) and repeated by the WAO (2016).

It is critical that in decision making due consideration must be given to the wide variety of advantages and disadvantages regarding the three options available, i.e. no change, Option 1 or Option 2. Option 1 has the greater number of advantages which supports the WAO (2010) reference to this being a model of best practice.

Factors to consider with decision making:

- If the Apprenticeship scheme for ward hostesses is approved in Princess of Wales, how this will fit into the overall ward hostess implementation plan for the Health Board?
- Nursing services currently fund £0.5 million which supports the current limited ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales. Consideration must be given to the arrangements for this funding if a three year phased implementation is agreed
- If a phased approach is agreed, implement the ward hostess service in wards with the highest vacancy rate.

There is an urgency to agree and commence the implementation of a ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales as this was recommended by the WAO (2010) and repeated by the WAO (2016). The Quality and Safety Committee are asked to note the contents of this paper.

Governance and Assurance							
<b>Link to corporate objectives</b> (please ✓)	Promoting and enabling healthier communities		Delivering excellent patient outcomes, experience and access		Demonstrating value and sustainability		Securing a fully engaged skilled workforce
	X		X		X		X
<b>Link to Health and Care Standards</b> (please ✓)	Staying Healthy	Safe Care	Effective Care	Dignified Care	Timely Care	Individual Care	Staff and Resources
	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Quality, Safety and Patient Experience							
<p>The inequitable ward hostess service across the Health Board continues. It is a priority to resolve this to ensure a safe, high quality ward service hostess is provided to all in-patients across the Health Board. This was recommended by the WAO (2010) and repeated by the WAO (2016). Patient feedback illustrates the positive impact the ward hostess service has on patient experience feedback.</p>							
Financial Implications							
<p>Money will need to be invested to fund the three year phased implementation. Cost efficiencies in this paper illustrate how cost savings can be re-invested to reduce the on-going cost of implementing a ward hostess service with a phased approach from 2018 – 2021 (see tables 10 and 11, page 8).</p> <p>The paper highlights the significant “unseen” estimated annual nursing costs in wards where nursing staff have to serve patient meals when no ward hostess service is available. This estimated cost is a total of £755,447 (46,748 hours).</p> <p>Nursing services currently fund £0.5 million which supports the current limited ward hostess service in Morriston and Princess of Wales. Consideration must be given to the arrangements for this funding if a three year phased implementation is agreed</p> <p>If the Apprenticeship scheme for ward hostesses is approved in Princess of Wales, how this will fit into the overall ward hostess implementation plan for the Health Board?</p>							
Legal Implications (including equality and diversity assessment)							
<p>49 wards across Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospital do not have a full, seven day ward hostess service. This results in an inequitable service across the Health Board.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The statutory requirement for nursing staff to undertake Level 1 Food Hygiene training and on-going compliance is a risk for the Health Board. Control measures put in place has reduced the risk score to 4 on Health Board risk register. On –going non-compliance places the Health Board at financial risk of being fined by the Environmental Health Department</li> <li>In 2016, Environmental Health Officers observed food practices on randomly</li> </ul>							

<p>chosen wards during Food Hygiene Rating inspections on-site; in Princess of Wales the Food Hygiene rating has reduced from 5 (the highest score) to 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A Band 5 nurse vacancy rate of 315 WTE is reported for May 2018.</li> </ul> <p>The challenge of nursing recruitment and retention is recognised on a national basis. The effect of nursing vacancies within the Health Board is compounded where nursing staff have to undertake ward hostess duties at meal times; this may have an adverse impact on the implementation of the Nurse Staffing (Wales) Act 2016</p>	
<b>Staffing Implications</b>	
<p>120.54 WTE Band 2 staff will need to be recruited to replicate the Singleton full ward hostess service in the 49 wards across Morriston and Princess of Wales Hospitals.</p> <p>If a phased approach to implementing a ward hostess service is agreed, wards with the highest number of nurse vacancies can be highlighted as priority areas to commence the ward hostess service. This will increase the number of nursing hours available to provide direct patient care.</p>	
<b>Long Term Implications (including the impact of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015)</b>	
<p><u>Prevention:</u> Hospital food is an essential part of in-patient care and is crucial in recovery from illness. This is an important factor in preventing deterioration in a patient's condition. Length of in-patient stay maybe reduced.</p> <p><u>Integration:</u> A seven day full ward hostess service plays a key part in the Health Board achieving the national standards set in the <i>All Wales Nutrition and Catering Standards for Food and Fluid Provision for Hospital Inpatients</i> (Welsh Government (WG), 2011).</p> <p><u>Involvement:</u> The Health Board must utilise patient feedback which illustrates the positive impact the ward hostess service has on patient experience.</p> <p><u>Collaboration:</u> Implementing a three year phased approach ward hostess service requires collaboration between a number of departments within the Health Board, i.e. Planning, Support Services and Nursing.</p> <p><u>Long Term:</u> Financial investment to implement a full ward hostess service across the Health will result in financial savings in the long term. In addition, a high standard of in-patient nutrition will have a positive impact on long term health for all generations.</p>	
<b>Report History</b>	<p>A number of reports have been submitted to the Board regarding implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board. Due to financial constraints, a phased approach has been recommended.</p>

Appendices	
Appendix 1 (page 23)	<u>Morrison Hospital and Princess of Wales Hospitals</u> Table 13. Estimated cost of nursing hours for undertaking catering duties
Appendix 2 (page 24)	Tables 14-15. Salary cost for implementing a ward hostess service using a three year phased approach
Appendix 3 (page 25)	Table 16. Projected food wastage cost savings with three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board
Appendix 4 (pages 26-27)	<u>Morrison Hospital</u> Tables 17-21. Additional costs to implement a ward hostess service.
Appendix 5 (pages 28-30)	<u>Princess of Wales Hospital</u> Tables 22-27. .Additional costs to implement a ward hostess service.
Appendix 6 (page 31)	<u>Morrison and Princess of Wales Hospitals</u> Table 28. Option 1: Cost with projected cost savings deducted.

## References

Wales Audit Office (2010) *Hospital Catering ABM University Health Board*.

Available at:

[https://www.wao.gov.uk/system/files/publications/ABMUHB\\_Hospital\\_Catering\\_English\\_2010.pdf](https://www.wao.gov.uk/system/files/publications/ABMUHB_Hospital_Catering_English_2010.pdf)

Wales Audit Office (2016) *Hospital Catering and Patient Nutrition Follow-up Review ABM University Health Board (2016)*. Available at:

[https://www.audit.wales/system/files/publications/ABMUHB\\_Hospital\\_Catering\\_Follow\\_Up\\_2014%28English%29.pdf](https://www.audit.wales/system/files/publications/ABMUHB_Hospital_Catering_Follow_Up_2014%28English%29.pdf)

## Appendix 1

### Morrison Hospital

Costing based on a Band 5 mid pay scale plus on costs (hourly rate £16.16).  
Estimate of 1 hour per mealtime serving

**Table 12. Estimated cost of nursing hours for undertaking catering duties**

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>13 wards have a 5 day service of 7 – 7.5 hour ward hostess service</li> <li>16 wards do not have a ward hostess service</li> </ul>					
	Number of wards	Daily nursing hours	Weekly nursing hours	Weekly cost of nursing hours	Annual cost of nursing hours
<b>Breakfast or Evening meal</b> (1 hour per meal)	13	13 5 day service	65 5 day service	£1,050	£54,620
<b>Weekend meals</b> (6 hours per weekend)	13		78	£1,260	£65,545
<b>All meals served by nursing staff</b>	16 3 meals per day	48 7 day service	336	£5,430	£282,348
<b>All meals served by ward hostess</b>	3	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>29</b>		<b>479</b>	<b>£7,740</b>	<b>£402,513</b>

### Princess of Wales Hospital

**Table 13. Estimated cost of nursing hours for undertaking catering duties**

	Number of wards	Daily nursing hours	Weekly nursing hours	Weekly cost of nursing hours	Annual cost of nursing hours
<b>All meals served by nursing staff</b>	20 3 meals per day	60	420	£67,872	<b>£352,934</b>
<b>All meals served by ward hostess</b>	4 *	0 *	0 *	0 *	0 *

\* During periods when support services could not cover all ward hostess hours, a full seven day ward hostess service has not been available in the pilot areas (wards 18, 19 and 20).

## Appendix 2

**Salary cost for implementing a ward hostess service using a three year phased approach**

**Band 2 top pay scale with on costs.**

**Table 14. Ward hostess: 10.75 hours per day / 2 shifts**

OPTION 1	Revenue cost per ward	2018 - 19	2019 - 20	2020 - 21
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
<b>Morriston</b>	£63,955.74	£575,602 9 wards	£1,215,159 10 wards (19 in total)	£1,854,716 10 wards (29 in total)
<b>Princess of Wales</b>	£63,955.74	£447,690 7 wards	£895,380 7 wards (14 in total)	£1,279,114 6 wards (20 in total)
<b>Total</b>		<b>£1,023,292</b>  <b>16 wards</b>	<b>£2,110,539</b>  <b>33 wards</b>	<b>£3,133,830</b>  <b>49 wards</b>

**Table 15. Ward hostess: 7 hours per day / 2 shifts**

OPTION 2	Revenue cost per ward	2018- 19	2019 - 20	2020 - 21
		Year 1	Year 3	Year 3
<b>Morriston</b>	£41,645.60	£374,810 9 wards	£791,266 10 wards (19 wards)	£1,207,722 10 wards (29 in total)
<b>Princess of Wales</b>	£41,645.60	£291,519 7 wards	£583,038 7 wards (14 in total)	£832,912 6 wards (20 in total)
<b>Total</b>		<b>£666,329</b>  <b>16 wards</b>	<b>£1,374,304</b>  <b>33 wards</b>	<b>£2,040,634</b>  <b>49 wards</b>



### Appendix 3

**Table 16. Projected food wastage cost savings with three year phased implementation of a ward hostess service across the Health Board**

	2017 – 18	2018 – 19	2019 – 20	2020 – 21
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
Food wastage	8%	7%	5%	5%
Cost of food wastage	£151,258	£132,350	£94,536	£94,536
Projected cost saving		£18,908	£56,722	£56,722
Projected cost saving per ward		£386	£1,157	£1,157
<b>Projected cost saving Morriston</b>		£3,474 (9 wards)	£21,983 (19 wards)	£33,553 (29 wards)
<b>Projected cost saving Princess of Wales</b>		£2,702 (7 wards)	£16,198 (14 wards)	£23,140 (20 wards)
<b>Total projected Cost saving</b>		<b>£6,176</b>	<b>£38,181</b>	<b>£56,693</b>

## Appendix 4

### Morrison Hospital

#### **Additional costs to implement a ward hostess service**

Food Hygiene Level 2 training over the 3 years: £2,958

Uniforms required over the three years: £6,510

**Table 17. Total cost prior to deduction of projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 1 10.75 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>
<b>Salary cost per ward</b>	£575,602	£1,215,159	£1,854,716
<b>Food Hygiene Level 2 training</b>	£918	£1,020	£1,020
<b>Uniforms</b>	£2,020	£2,245	£2,245
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£578,540</b>	<b>£1,218,424</b>	<b>£1,857,981</b>
<b>Number of wards</b>	9 wards	10 wards (19 in total)	10 wards (29 in total)

**Table 18. Option 2: Total cost prior to deduction of projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 2 7 hours per day</b>	<b>2018- 19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>
	<b>Year 1</b>	<b>Year 3</b>	<b>Year 3</b>
<b>Salary cost per ward</b>	£374,810	£791,266	£1,207,722
<b>Food Hygiene Level 2 training</b>	£918	£1020	£1020
<b>Uniforms</b>	£2,020	£2,245	£2,245
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£377,748</b>	<b>£794,531</b>	<b>£1,210,987</b>
<b>Number of wards</b>	9 wards	10 wards (19 in total)	10 wards (29 in total)

## **Morrison Hospital**

**Table 19. Cost savings**

	<b>2018 – 19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>
	<b>Year 1</b>	<b>Year 2</b>	<b>Year 3</b>
<b>Projected reduced food wastage</b>	£3,474 (9 wards)	£21,983 (19 wards)	£33,553 (29 wards)
<b>Transfer funds from closure of Ward 20 in Singleton</b>	£63,956	£63,956	£63,956
<b>Total cost of savings</b>	<b>£67,430</b>	<b>£85,939</b>	<b>£97,509</b>

**Table 20. Option 1: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 1 10.75 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>
	<b>Year 1</b>	<b>Year 2</b>	<b>Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£578,540	£1,218,419	£1,857,976
Total cost Savings	£67,430	£85,939	£97,509
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£511,110</b>	<b>£1,132,480</b>	<b>£1,760,467</b>

**Table 21. Option 2: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 2 7 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>
	<b>Year 1</b>	<b>Year 2</b>	<b>Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£377,748	£794,531	£1,210,987
Total cost Savings	£67,428	£85,939	£97,509
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£310,320</b>	<b>£708,592</b>	<b>£1,113,478</b>

## Appendix 5

### Princess of Wales Hospital

Food Hygiene Level 2 training over the 3 years: £2,042

Uniforms required over the three years: £4,490

**Table 22. Option 1: Total cost prior to deduction of projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 1</b> <b>10.75 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b> <b>Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b> <b>Year 2</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b> <b>Year 3</b>
<b>Salary cost per ward</b>	£447,690	£895,380	£1,279,114
<b>Food Hygiene Level 2 training</b>	£715	£715	£612
<b>Uniforms</b>	£1568	£1568	£1344
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£449,972</b>	<b>£897,662</b>	<b>£1,281,070</b>
<b>Number of wards</b>	7 wards	7 wards (14 in total)	6 wards (20 in total)

**Table 23. Option 2: Total cost prior to deduction of projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 2</b> <b>7 hours per day</b>	<b>2018- 19</b> <b>Year 1</b>	<b>2019 - 20</b> <b>Year 2</b>	<b>2020 - 21</b> <b>Year 3</b>
<b>Salary cost per ward</b>	£291,519	£583,038	£832,912
<b>Food Hygiene Level 2 training</b>	£714	£714	£612
<b>Uniforms</b>	£1568	£1568	£1344
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£293,801</b>	<b>£585,320</b>	<b>£834,868</b>
<b>Number of wards</b>	7 wards	7 wards (14 in total)	6 wards (20 in total)

## **Princess of Wales Hospital**

**Table 24. Option 1: Projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 1 10.75 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19 Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20 Year 2</b>	<b>2020 – 21 Year 3</b>
<b>Projected reduced food wastage</b>	£2,702 (7 wards)	£16,198 (14 wards)	£23,140 (20 wards)
<b>Replacing 3 pilot wards in PoW with permanent service Option 1</b>	£8,133	£8,133	£8,133
<b>Total cost of savings</b>	<b>£10,835</b>	<b>£24,331</b>	<b>£31,273</b>

**Table 25. Option 2: Projected cost savings**

<b>OPTION 2 7 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19 Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20 Year 2</b>	<b>2020 – 21 Year 3</b>
<b>Food wastage</b>	£2,702 (7 wards)	£16,198 (14 wards)	£23,140 (20 wards)
<b>Replacing pilot wards in PoW with permanent service Option 2</b>	£75,065	£75,065	£75,065
<b>Total cost of savings</b>	<b>£77,767</b>	<b>£91,263</b>	<b>£98,205</b>

## **Princess of Wales Hospital**

**Table 26. Option 1: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 1 10.75 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19  Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20  Year 3</b>	<b>2020 – 21  Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£449,972	£897,662	£1,281,070
Total cost savings	£10,835	£24,331	£31,273
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£439,137</b>	<b>£873,331</b>	<b>£1,249,797</b>

**Table 27. Option 2: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 2 7 hours per day</b>	<b>2018 – 19  Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20  Year 2</b>	<b>2020 – 21  Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£293,801	£585,320	£834,867
Total cost Savings	£77,767	£91,263	£98,205
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£216,034</b>	<b>£494,057</b>	<b>£736,662</b>

## Appendix 6

### Morrison and Princess of Wales Hospitals

**Table 28. Option 1: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 1</b> <b>10.75 hours per</b> <b>day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b>  <b>Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>  <b>Year 24</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>  <b>Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£1,028,512	£2,116,081	£3,139,046
Total cost Savings	£78,265	£110,270	£128,782
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£950,247</b>	<b>£2,005,811</b>	<b>£3,010,264</b>

**Table 29. Option 2: Cost with projected cost savings deducted**

<b>OPTION 2</b> <b>7 hours per</b> <b>day</b>	<b>2018 – 19</b>  <b>Year 1</b>	<b>2019 – 20</b>  <b>Year 2</b>	<b>2020 – 21</b>  <b>Year 3</b>
Cost before savings	£671,549	£1,379,851	£2,045,854
Total cost Savings	£145,195	£177,202	£195,714
<b>Total cost</b>	<b>£526,354</b>	<b>£1,202,649</b>	<b>£1,850,140</b>