



WALES AUDIT OFFICE
SWYDDFA ARCHWILIO CYMRU

Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru
Auditor General for Wales

Implementing the Well-being of Future Generations Act – **Swansea Bay University Health Board**

Audit year: 2019

Date issued: October 2019

Document reference: 1513A2019-20



This document has been prepared as part of work performed in accordance with statutory functions, including s15 of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. In the event of receiving a request for information to which this document may be relevant, attention is drawn to the Code of Practice issued under section 45 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The section 45 Code sets out the practice in the handling of requests that is expected of public authorities, including consultation with relevant third parties. In relation to this document, the Auditor General for Wales, the Wales Audit Office and relevant third parties. Any enquiries regarding disclosure or re-use of this document should be sent to the Wales Audit Office at info.officer@audit.wales.

We welcome correspondence and telephone calls in Welsh and English. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth a galwadau ffôn yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

The team who delivered the work comprised Katrina Febry and Nathan Couch.

Contents

The Health Board has made progress in applying the sustainable development principle but recognises there is more work to do.

Summary report

Background	5
Focus of the work	5
Main findings	6
Improvement opportunities	7

Detailed report

Part 1 – Corporate arrangements	9
Steps have been taken to embed the sustainable development principle in planning and engaging with service users, but the Health Board could do more to embed the sustainable principle in the organisational culture	9
Part 2 – Examination of the Health Board’s approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales	12
Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has a strong focus on the five ways of working, but the Health Board acknowledges it could collaborate with and involve other groups, organisations and staff	12
The Health Board has identified the long-term benefits of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project, but needs to ensure that delivery of benefits can be sustained	13
Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has a clear preventative focus but it is not yet clear how the Health Board will measure the impact on staff, patients and service users	14
Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will contribute to the delivery of Public Service Board and national wellbeing goals, and colleagues are working proactively across organisational boundaries. However, there are opportunities to work with neighbouring local authorities to ensure Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales and other green space projects collectively support delivering Public Service Board wellbeing objectives	15
The Health Board is collaborating well with Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partner organisations and is focused on outcomes, but there are opportunities to collaborate with other groups and organisations	16

Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales is at an early stage and thus opportunities to involve wider stakeholder groups have been limited, however, wider engagement will help the Health Board achieve the aims of the project 18

Appendices

Appendix 1 – the step: the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales	19
Appendix 2 – the Five Ways of Working	21
Appendix 3 – the Health Board's Management Response to improvement opportunities	23

Summary report

Background

- 1 In accordance with the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the Act) the Auditor General for Wales (the Auditor General) is statutorily required to examine public bodies to assess the extent to which they have acted in accordance with the sustainable development principle when:
 - a. setting their wellbeing objectives; and
 - b. taking steps to meet them.
- 2 The Act defines the sustainable development (SD) principle as acting in a manner: ‘...which seeks to ensure that the needs of the present are met without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs’.
- 3 The Auditor General must provide a report on his examinations to the National Assembly for Wales at least a year before each Assembly election. The first such report must be published by 2020, before the 2021 Assembly election.
- 4 In May 2018, the Auditor General published a preliminary report, [Reflecting on Year One – How have public bodies responded to the Well-being of Future Generations Act \(2015\)](#). He concluded that public bodies support the principles of the Act and are taking steps to change how they work.
- 5 During 2018 and 2019, the Auditor General has undertaken examinations across the 44 bodies covered by the Act to inform his 2020 report to the National Assembly. In developing our approach to undertaking the examinations, we engaged with a range of stakeholders and carried out pilot work during 2017-18. We have also worked closely with the Future Generations Commissioner.
- 6 The preliminary work we undertook in 2017 included a consideration of how public bodies had set their wellbeing objectives. The principal focus of our 2019 work is the way in which public bodies are taking steps to meet their wellbeing objectives.
- 7 We undertook our review at the Swansea Bay University Health Board (the Health Board) between May and August 2019.

Focus of the work

- 8 We reviewed the extent to which the Health Board is:
 - applying the SD principle and the five ways of working to do things differently;
 - embedding the SD principle in core arrangements and processes; and
 - involving and working with citizens and stakeholders to deliver its wellbeing duty.
- 9 We carried out a high-level review of how the Health Board has continued to develop its corporate arrangements since our baseline work in 2017 to inform the Auditor General’s one-year commentary in 2018. We also examined the extent to which the Health Board is acting in accordance with the SD principle and applying

the five ways of working through a step to meet a wellbeing objective. Specifically, we reviewed the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales. Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales is a partnership designed to improve green spaces in the Swansea Bay area, improve grasslands and protect Wales' most threatened species (described in [Appendix 1](#)).

- 10 [Exhibit 1](#) summarises the five ways of working as defined in the Welsh Government's [Well-being of Future Generations \(Wales\) Act 2015 The Essentials](#) document. [Appendix 2](#) outlines positive indicators for each of the five ways of working that we have identified and used as part of our examination.

Exhibit 1: the 'five ways of working' as defined by the Welsh Government

The Five Ways of Working
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long term – The importance of balancing short-term needs with the need to safeguard the ability to also meet long-term needs. • Prevention – How acting to prevent problems occurring or getting worse may help public bodies meet their objectives. • Integration – Considering how the public body's wellbeing objectives may impact upon each of the wellbeing goals, on their other objectives, or on the objectives of other public bodies. • Collaboration – Acting in collaboration with any other person (or different parts of the body itself) that could help the body to meet its wellbeing objectives. • Involvement – The importance of involving people with an interest in achieving the wellbeing goals and ensuring that those people reflect the diversity of the area which the body serves.

- 11 This report sets out our findings on the Health Board's corporate approach to embedding the SD principle and how the five ways of working have been applied through its work on developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales (the step).

Main findings

- 12 Our examination found that **the Health Board has made progress in applying the SD principle but recognises there is more work to do.**
- 13 We reached this conclusion because:
- Steps have been taken to embed the SD principle in planning and engaging with service users, but the Health Board could do more to embed the sustainable principle in the organisational culture; and
 - Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has a strong focus on the five ways of working, but the Health Board acknowledges it could collaborate with and involve other groups, organisations and staff.

14 Our findings are discussed in detail in the following sections of this report.

Improvement opportunities

- 15 As the main provision of the Act came into force in 2016, it is inevitable that public bodies will need time to fully effect that change. We recognise that this is a transition period and that all public bodies are on a learning path.
- 16 We presented our findings at a workshop of key representatives involved in developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales in August 2019. At this workshop the Health Board considered our findings, identified opportunities for further action in relation to the step and began to consider its response.
- 17 **Exhibit 2** sets out these opportunities for further action, which are intended to support continued development and embedding of the SD principles and five ways of working. We have also included opportunities to improve overall corporate arrangements for embedding the SD principle identified during our work.

Exhibit 2: opportunities for further action

Opportunities for action	
Corporate arrangements	
I1	Ensure Health Board wellbeing objectives reflect the full scope of the seven national wellbeing goals. The Health Board should review its existing wellbeing objectives and explore opportunities to better align its wellbeing objectives with organisational objectives to help extend their focus.
I2	Ensure the Health Board sets out the steps it is taking to deliver wellbeing objectives. The Health Board should set out the steps it is taking to deliver wellbeing objectives and report the progress towards delivering them.
Ways of working	
Long term	
I3	Ensure that strategic decisions and service planning incorporate and take account of the ambitions for green spaces in the Health Board's estate. Incorporate the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project into the Health Board's Strategy, Integrated Medium Term Plan 2020-2023 and supporting Estates Strategy, including the actions to be implemented, timeframe and intended benefits and outcomes.
I4	Ensure that the Health Board has enough capacity to support implementing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project at each of the 40 sites. The Health Board should set out the capacity and time commitment required by corporate and estates staff against the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales action plan/timetable. This will help to determine whether existing capacity is adequate. Change should be progressive to be manageable within existing capacity.

Opportunities for action

Prevention

- I5 **Ensure that the Health Board has arrangements to monitor that intended outcomes are achieved for staff, patients and service users.** The Health Board should determine how it will evaluate the impact on the health and wellbeing of staff, patients and service users and ensure that that individual sites achieve the best outcomes for users.

Integration

- I6 **Ensure that opportunities to work with local authorities and other partners are fully optimised.**
- engage with local authorities to identify where green spaces developed separately by local authorities and the Health Board can achieve synergy; and
 - identify all opportunities to share learning with local authorities.

Collaboration

- I7 **Ensure that the Health Board explores all opportunities to involve wider staff expertise to inform and contribute to Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales.** The Health Board should determine how it will involve wider staff groups in the project to provide expertise in engagement, patient liaison, improving wellbeing, survey design and volunteer engagement.

Involvement

- I8 **Ensure that the Health Board informs engagement plans developed for Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales.** The Health Board should determine how it will involve wider groups in the design and development of the 40 site plans, including staff, patients and their families, service users, existing volunteer groups and other organisations that could contribute.

- 18 The Health Board's management response will be inserted as **Appendix 3** once developed and agreed. The final report will be published on the Wales Audit Office website after consideration by the Board or a relevant board committee.

Detailed report

Part 1 – Corporate arrangements

Steps have been taken to embed the sustainable development principle in planning and engaging with service users, but the Health Board could do more to embed the sustainable principle in the organisational culture

- 19 Prior to examination of work in relation to the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales we wanted to understand how the corporate arrangements support delivery of that work.
- 20 The Health Board developed three draft wellbeing objectives during 2017-18, and adopted them unchanged in November 2018. Our review found that the wellbeing objectives are consistent with organisational aims and objectives and embedded in the Health Board's ten-year Organisational Strategy, five-year Clinical Services Plan and Annual Operating Plan 2019-20.
- 21 The Health Board is a statutory partner of two public services boards (PSBs), Swansea PSB and Neath Port Talbot PSB. Both PSBs published wellbeing objectives in 2018. However, the Health Board did not revise its wellbeing objectives to reflect those of the PSBs. Therefore, currently the Health Board does not have corresponding wellbeing objectives in areas such as green infrastructure/biodiversity and ageing well.
- 22 The focus of the Health Board's wellbeing objectives is health and wellbeing and they do not reflect the wider scope of the seven national wellbeing goals (for example, social, environmental and cultural goals). However, the Health Board does have organisational objectives in some of these areas, for example, relating to green infrastructure and carbon reduction. There is an opportunity for the Health Board to align its wellbeing objectives with organisational objectives to help extend their focus. The Welsh Government's Statutory Guidance on the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 explicitly sets out that wellbeing objectives should not be 'an additional layer' to existing activity.
- 23 At the Health Board's May 2019 Board Development Session on wellbeing and future generations, Board members discussed the potential to review the organisational wellbeing objectives to better reflect the full scope of the seven national wellbeing goals. In September 2019, the Board agreed that the Health Board's wellbeing objectives should reflect all seven national wellbeing goals, and hence will also better reflect the PSB's wellbeing objectives too.
- 24 Our review found that the Health Board has not explicitly set out the steps it is taking to deliver wellbeing objectives or reported progress towards meeting them. The Health Board intends to better reflect the steps it is taking to achieve wellbeing objectives in future annual reports and in the Integrated Medium Term Plan.

- 25 In particular, we wanted to understand whether the Health Board is responding to the SD principle and the five ways of working by:
- doing things differently to deliver change;
 - developing core arrangements and processes; and
 - involving citizens and stakeholders.
- 26 Our findings are set out in [Exhibit 3](#).

Exhibit 3: embedding the SD principle and the five ways of working

Doing things differently to deliver change
<p>Steps have been taken to embed the SD principle into planning, but the Health Board recognises there is more to do to embed the sustainable principle in the organisational culture and behaviours of staff</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Health Board recognises that translating the WFG Act into everyday practice is reliant on the way it develops strategies, plan, policies and procedures. • The Health Board has taken steps to embed its wellbeing objectives and the SD principle into its Strategy, Clinical Service Plan and the Annual Operating Plan 2019-20 (including supporting plans). • In developing regional plans with partners, the Health Board is applying the five ways of working. For instance, the West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board's¹ Adult Mental Health Strategic Framework, developed in 2018, is a long-term programme for developing new services and was co-developed with people living with mental health problems. • The Health Board recognises that it is in the early stages of embedding SD principles into the culture of the organisation and behaviours of its staff. The Health Board told us that securing staff understanding of the opportunities and requirements of the WFG Act continues to be a challenge due to scale and complexity of the organisation. In addition, the focus of the Health Board in recent years has been on addressing significant performance and financial challenges alongside delivering the boundary change of healthcare services for the Bridgend population.
Developing core arrangements and processes
<p>The Health Board has developed guidance to support service delivery units apply the SD principle, and is setting up monitoring arrangements with the aim of ensuring that the Act is considered core business</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Health Board has developed guidance on applying the SD principle for Delivery Units when producing service plans underpinning the Annual Operating Plan/Integrated Medium Term Plan. In addition, Delivery Units must include milestones against delivering organisational objectives (including wellbeing objectives), reinforcing the need for Delivery Units to demonstrate their application of the five ways of working. • Where service plans propose changes needing additional revenue or capital commitments, business case must set out how the SD principle and five ways of working will be applied.

¹ The Social Services and Well-being (Wales) Act 2014 created Regional Partnership Boards to deliver integrated social care. West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board comprises Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, City and County of Swansea Council, Swansea Bay University Health Board, organisations in the third and independent sectors and citizen and carer representatives.

Developing core arrangements and processes

- The Health Board has established a Sustainable Development Group to oversee implementation of the Act (chaired by the Executive Director of Strategy, and the Director of Public Health is the Vice-Chair).
- The Health Board has agreed that it will develop a high-level framework for addressing the requirements of the Act through a systematic approach in planning, reporting and cultural change, across the organisation and into our partner relationships.
- All Board and Committee papers must include an impact assessment setting out the implications of the matter set out in the paper on the WFG Act.
- The Health Board is considering introducing responsibilities for overseeing partnership arrangements and embedding the WFG Act into the remit of a Board committee.
- As well as participating in the two PSBs and the West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board, the Health Board is also a partner in the ARCH Programme. ARCH is a partnership between the Health Board, Hywel Dda University Health Board and Swansea University to improve the health, wealth and wellbeing for the population of South West Wales. The Health Board told us that in 2019, the Arch Programme was reviewed and repurposed by partners to clarify how the WFG Act will be embedded in work across the region.

Involving citizens and stakeholders

The Health Board has put some arrangements in place to engage service users, citizens and stakeholders

- The West Glamorgan Regional Partnership Board has set up a citizens' panel, in addition to the existing Stakeholder Reference Group. The citizens' panel has formed a Coproduction Group which has developed a set of principles (including the SD principle) to be applied to all planning groups and service transformation projects which the Health Board takes part in.
- The Health Board has its own Stakeholder Reference Group (SRG) which scrutinises the work of the Board. The SRG meets bimonthly in advance of Board meetings to review the Board meeting agenda and produces a report on all items which will impact on citizens. The SRG report is submitted to the Board meeting for review.
- The Health Board also has a communication and engagement strategy for its work with the Community Health Council when changing service plans.

Part 2 – Examination of the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales

Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has a strong focus on the five ways of working, but the Health Board acknowledges it could collaborate with and involve other groups, organisations and staff

- 27 Biophilic Wales is a three-year project funded by the Welsh Government under the Enabling Natural Resources and Well-being Grant Scheme (ENRaW). The project aims to increase the wellbeing of people, biodiversity and the environment throughout Wales.
- 28 Whilst Biophilic Wales projects will be undertaken in other areas in Wales, the first project to be rolled out is the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project. Therefore, the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project will act as a pilot and enable the approach to be tested before other partnerships roll out projects in other areas in Wales.
- 29 Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales is a partnership including the Botanic Garden of Wales (BGW), Natural Resources Wales (NRW), Swansea University and the Health Board along with other partners and collaborators.
- 30 The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project includes three main sub-projects:
 - Inspiring Spaces aims to transform amenity grasslands and under-utilised outdoor areas for people to enjoy, connect with nature, and benefit from being outdoors and restored by the natural world. The Health Board, working with BGW, other partners and volunteers, will seek to deliver 40 community co-developed green infrastructure projects within the Health Board's estate.
 - Grasslands for Life aims to develop resilient grassland ecosystems by revolutionising monitoring and strengthening restoration activities.
 - Plants for People aims to protect Wales' most threatened plants by planting endangered plant species and collecting seeds for a seed bank.
- 31 In December 2018, a joint funding application was submitted by Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales for a grant of £977,000 covering three years. The Welsh Government accepted the application in August 2019. The aim is to mainstream the work beyond the three-year funded life of the project through the development of management plans for each of the 40 sites and training for Health Board estates staff and volunteer groups.
- 32 Further information on the step is set out in [Appendix 1](#).

- 33 In this report, references to the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales are specifically to the project being undertaken in the Swansea Bay area, and the focus of our work is the Health Board's involvement and participation in the project rather than other partners.

The Health Board has identified the long-term benefits of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project, but needs to ensure that delivery of benefits can be sustained

- 34 We looked for evidence of:

- a thorough understanding of current and long-term needs and the associated challenges and opportunities;
- planning over an appropriate timescale;
- resources allocated to ensure long-term benefits; and
- appropriate monitoring and review.

- 35 Strengths:

- the Health Board has a clear understanding of the long-and short-term environmental and wellbeing benefits of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project. A sustainability plan setting out long-term intentions beyond the funded phase is included in the project's Delivery Plan.
- the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project is designed to deliver short and long-term benefits. The benefits include increasing biodiversity, increasing carbon stores, improving air quality and helping to protect threatened species whilst also delivering improved wellbeing for service users, staff and local communities. In addition, the project will help to develop approaches and tools that can be used to inform future Biophilic Wales projects in other areas in Wales.
- Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will help the Health Board to manage its estates differently, achieving environmental and wellbeing benefits. A different approach is planned for each site, to best suit the needs of the site and local environment/community.
- training will be provided to Health Board estates staff and volunteers, and this should enable the project to be sustained beyond the three-year funded phase. Estates staff and volunteers will be encouraged to develop new skills by accessing the training.
- the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partner organisations have developed a Delivery Plan which sets out what will be delivered, key milestones, expected outcomes and mitigating actions to reduce risk.

- 36 Areas for further action:

- whilst the grant funded core project team will develop plans for each of the 40 sites, the work will be undertaken by Health Board estates staff and

contractors within existing financial means with additional support provided by volunteers:

- as the project is in its infancy, the level of volunteer support is unknown, and if too few volunteers are recruited, it may impact on delivery and sustained success. The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project risk register includes the possibility that volunteer capacity may not be enough and identifies mitigating actions to encourage and sustain the required number of volunteers.
- whilst it is intended that the design of sites should not require more Health Board resources, it is unclear whether senior staff and operational estates staff will have the capacity to sustain the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project. Change will have to be progressive, to ensure that staffing levels are adequate.

Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has a clear preventative focus but it is not yet clear how the Health Board will measure the impact on staff, patients and service users

37 We looked for evidence of:

- a thorough understanding of the nature and type of problem the step could help prevent from occurring or getting worse;
- resources allocated to ensure preventative benefits will be delivered; and
- monitoring and review of how effectively the step is preventing problems from occurring or getting worse.

38 Strengths:

- previous work undertaken within the Health Board highlighted the positive benefits of outdoor spaces for staff and for patients and their families whilst staying in hospital or using the Health Board's services.
- the Health Board's participation in Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales means that the Health Board is working outside of its traditional remit of health and wellbeing to achieve preventative environmental goals.
- by partnering with BGW, NRW and Swansea University, the Health Board has access to scientific/horticultural expertise to determine which interventions will improve biodiversity, protect endangered species and enhance the natural environment.
- initial baseline surveys of the 40 sites will be undertaken by BGW and Swansea University staff. Ongoing monitoring of sites will continue through the project lifespan and beyond to evaluate the impact of interventions (for example, on the biodiversity value of each site).
- volunteers will be asked to complete surveys to help assess social and cultural change, for example, by comparing scoring of physical and wellbeing at the start of the project and over the first year.

39 Areas for further action:

- Health Board staff participation in Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales has so far largely been limited to a small number of staff; it is necessary to ensure that wider decision-making and accountability arrangements recognise the value of preventative action. At a corporate level it would be helpful to set out the aims of the project, the anticipated preventative benefits and outcomes, and how the initiative will help deliver wellbeing objectives.
- it is unclear how the Health Board will evaluate the impact on health and wellbeing of staff, patients and service users to ensure that that individual sites achieve the best outcomes for users.

Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will contribute to the delivery of PSB and national wellbeing goals, and colleagues are working proactively across organisational boundaries. However, there are opportunities to work with neighbouring local authorities to ensure Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales and other green space projects collectively support delivering PSB wellbeing objectives

40 We looked for evidence of consideration of:

- how this step could contribute to the seven national wellbeing goals;
- how delivery of this step will impact on the Health Board's wellbeing objectives and wider priorities; and
- how delivery of this step will impact on other public bodies' wellbeing objectives.

41 Strengths:

- Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will contribute to the delivery of national wellbeing goals and aligns to the wellbeing objectives of both Swansea and Neath Port Talbot PSBs;
- Health Board staff involved in the project recognise the cross-organisation dependencies of achieving ambitions;
- Health Board staff involved in the project are working proactively across organisation boundaries with Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partners to maximise their contribution to wellbeing goals;
- Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will help to deliver internal benefits such as increasing understanding of managing estates to achieve environmental and wellbeing benefits; and
- the Health Board told us they felt Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales will increase the profile and appreciation of estates and technical services staff.

42 Areas for further action:

- Whilst the Health Board has strategic aims on the themes of improving health and wellbeing of local communities and improving the environment/biodiversity, the step does not align to any of the Health Board's wellbeing objectives.
- The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project is in its infancy. ENRaW grant funding applications must be kept out of the public domain until confirmed as successful. As the application was accepted in August 2019, the aims and benefits of the project have not yet been set out in the Health Board's Annual Operating Plan or Strategy. The aims of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project have not been shared with the wider Health Board staff yet. There is a risk that despite best-made plans to improve green spaces within the Health Board's estate, future changes to implement clinical services plans may involve increasing the footprint of existing buildings and could negatively impact or reduce green spaces. Since our review, the Health Board has indicated that wellbeing objectives will be considered when developing service delivery plans underpinning the Integrated Medium Term Plan and Clinical Service Plan). At an operational level there is sharing of intelligence about green infrastructure projects between PSB partners. The Health Board was unable to share specific information about the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project with PSB partners until the grant funding was agreed (due to the reasons set out in [paragraph 41](#), [bullet point 2](#). Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and the City and County of Swansea Council are both involved in a similar green infrastructure project. There are opportunities for the Health Board and the two local authorities to align aims for green spaces, particularly where local authority and Health Board land is near or adjacent to each other. High level meetings have recently commenced with the local authorities to share the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Delivery Plan and ambitions. In addition, Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partners are exploring opportunities with the two local authorities to co-develop ways of monitoring how their respective projects can measure wellbeing gains. The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales grant-funded team will be responsible for engaging with neighbouring local authorities.

The Health Board is collaborating well with Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partner organisations and is focused on outcomes, but there are opportunities to collaborate with other groups and organisations

43 We looked for evidence that the Health Board:

- has considered how it could work with others to deliver the step (to meet its wellbeing objectives, or assist another body to meet its wellbeing objectives);
- is collaborating effectively to deliver the step; and

- is monitoring and reviewing whether the collaboration is helping it, or its stakeholders meet wellbeing objectives.

44 Strengths:

- there were only six weeks available to develop the grant funding application. However, as there is a common goal, Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partner organisations came together quickly to co-develop the Delivery Plan. Partner organisations have collectively developed the Delivery Plan and have built trust and a mutual understanding of priorities.
- the Health Board recognises and values the contributions that Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales partners can make, such as providing expertise in environmental matters.
- once recruited, a key component of the grant funded project team's responsibilities will be to make connections between partner organisations and other organisations and to ensure that communication continues to flow.
- the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales team aim to draw upon previous experiences of collaborating with community groups and other organisations to create green infrastructure, including;
 - achieving the Green Flag Award for the heritage orchard planted at Glanrhyd Hospital²; and
 - developing a garden with BGW for the RHS Cardiff Flower Show, which will be replicated at Morriston Hospital.
- Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales is a pilot and future Biophilic Wales projects will be rolled out across Wales by other partnerships receiving ENRaW funding. Learning from the pilot will be used to inform the roll-out elsewhere in Wales.

45 Areas for further action:

- for the reasons set out in **paragraph 41, bullet point 2**, the Health Board has not yet been able to collaborate with wider Health Board teams that could provide expertise to contribute to Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales. There are plans to engage with staff with expertise in engagement, patient liaison, improving wellbeing, survey design and volunteer engagement. The Health Board told us the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales team will undertake stakeholder mapping to identify staff representatives to contribute multi-disciplinary expertise to the project.
- estate staff responsible for ground maintenance will need to collaborate with Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project partners and volunteers to change how they manage green spaces. They will need to identify how they will

² Glanrhyd Hospital was formerly part of the Health Board at the time the Green Flag Award Project was developed and implemented, although it is now within the Cwm Taf Morgannwg University Health Board boundary.

come together to collectively agree the design and ongoing responsibilities for maintenance.

Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales is at an early stage and thus opportunities to involve wider stakeholder groups have been limited, however, wider engagement will help the Health Board achieve the aims of the project

46 We looked for evidence that the Health Board has:

- identified who it needs to involve in designing and delivering the step;
- effectively involved key stakeholders in designing and delivering the step;
- used the results of involvement to shape the development and delivery of the step; and
- sought to learn lessons and improve its approach to involvement.

47 Strengths:

- the Health Board told us it was not possible to involve local communities in the development of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Delivery Plan. This was due to the time constraints of the application stage. However, an engagement plan will be developed once the grant-funded project staff are appointed. It is intended that events will be held within Health Board sites to engage the public, allow communities to be involved in the design of many of the 40 sites, and to encourage people to volunteer.
- the Health Board recognises it needs to engage with service users and staff to help identify their needs to inform the planning of sites. There is recognition that 'one size fits all' is not appropriate, and that each of the 40 sites will have differing purposes and challenges, for example, some sites will need to consider the personal security of users. Involving user groups early will inform plans for the individual sites.
- partners are identifying potential opportunities to involve as many people as possible, such as arranging site visits for schools and involving patients within hospitals who are unable to leave their beds with a Virtual Reality experience.

48 Area for further action:

- It was not possible to involve other organisations when the Delivery Plan was developed, due to the reasons set out in **paragraph 41, bullet point 2**. However, partner organisations recognise that other organisations could make a useful contribution to the delivery of the project (such as local businesses, Health Board suppliers, charities and volunteer groups). The Health Board told us as part of the stakeholder mapping exercise (**paragraph 45**) it will identify partner organisations and local businesses and charities to engage and collaborate with. The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales intend to develop a communications strategy to support wider engagement.

Appendix 1

The step: the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales

Information provided by the Health Board on the step

Why is the Health Board doing this?

Previous work undertaken within the Health Board has highlighted the positive benefits of outdoor spaces for patients and their families whilst staying in hospital or using the Health Board's services. Since then, the Health Board has considered how it may improve the natural value, aesthetics and accessibility to green spaces within the estate and how these may have a positive impact on the health and wellbeing of staff, patients, service users and local communities.

The Well-being of Future Generations Act 2015 led both Neath Port Talbot and Swansea Public Services Boards (PSBs) to develop wellbeing objectives focused on improving the natural environment, reducing carbon footprints and using natural spaces to improve health and wellbeing.

The Health Board has strategic aims to;

- support better health and wellbeing by actively promoting and empowering people to live well in resilient communities; and
- reduce the Health Board's carbon footprint, improve biodiversity and help to protect threatened species.

Participating in the project will also help the Health Board meet other environmental requirements, such as those set out in the Environment Act (Wales) April 2016.

What is the Health Board doing to achieve this step?

To support the grant-funding application, the partner organisations developed a Delivery Plan which sets out the key milestones, expected outcomes and benefits, monitoring arrangements, responsibilities, and risks with mitigating actions.

ENRaW grant funding will be used to fund three WTE staff: a Green Infrastructure Officer, a Botanical Horticulturist and a Project Administrator, to be based at and managed by BGW. This team will be responsible for project delivery and developing the finer details of project delivery, including

- baseline surveys of the Health Board's sites, to be undertaken with BGW and Swansea University students;
- a management plan for each of the Health Board's 40 sites;
- engaging and recruiting volunteers to support the work;
- training to be provided by NGBW staff to Health Board staff and volunteers;

- implementing the management plan for each site, supported by the Health Board's Estates and Technical Services departments and working closely with volunteers; and
- undertaking ongoing environmental monitoring and developing the protocols and tools for environmental monitoring with BGW and Swansea University students.

Appendix 2

The Five Ways of Working

The table sets out 'positive indicators' for each of the five ways of working that we have identified and used to help inform our assessments of the extent to which bodies may be applying the SD Principle. We do not intend the indicators to be used as a 'checklist'. We have used them as 'indicators' to help us to form conclusions, rather than 'determinants' of the extent to which a body is acting in accordance with the SD Principle in taking steps to meet its wellbeing objectives.

Exhibit 4: the five ways of working

What would show a body is fully applying the long-term way of working?
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• There is a clear understanding of what 'long term' means in the context of the Act.• They have designed the step to deliver the wellbeing objective(s) and contribute to their long-term vision.• They have designed the step to deliver short or medium-term benefits, which are balanced with the impact over the long term (within the project context).• They have designed the step based on a sophisticated understanding of current and future need and pressures, including analysis of future trends.• Consequently, there is a comprehensive understanding of current and future risks and opportunities.• Resources have been allocated to ensure long-term as well as short-term benefits are delivered.• There is a focus on delivering outcomes, with milestones/progression steps identified where outcomes will be delivered over the long term.• They are open to new ways of doing things which could help deliver benefits over the longer term.• They value intelligence and pursue evidence-based approaches.
What would show a body is fully applying the preventative way of working?
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The body seeks to understand the root causes of problems so that negative cycles and intergenerational challenges can be tackled.• The body sees challenges from a system-wide perspective, recognising and valuing the long-term benefits that they can deliver for people and places.• The body allocates resources to preventative action that is likely to contribute to better outcomes and use of resources over the longer term, even where this may limit the ability to meet some short-term needs.• There are decision-making and accountability arrangements that recognise the value of preventative action and accept short-term reductions in performance and resources in the pursuit of anticipated improvements in outcomes and use of resources.

What would show a body is taking an 'integrated' approach?

- Individuals at all levels understand their contribution to the delivery of the vision and wellbeing objectives.
- Individuals at all levels understand what different parts of the organisation do and proactively seek opportunities to work across organisational boundaries. This is replicated in their work with other public bodies.
- Individuals at all levels recognise the cross-organisation dependencies of achieving the ambition and objectives.
- There is an open culture where information is shared.
- There is a well-developed understanding of how the wellbeing objectives and steps to meet them impact on other public sector bodies.
- Individuals proactively work across organisational boundaries to maximise their contribution across the wellbeing goals and minimise negative impacts.
- Governance, structures and processes support this, as do behaviours.

What would show a body is collaborating effectively?

- The body is focused on place, community and outcomes rather than organisational boundaries.
- The body has a good understanding of partners' objectives and their responsibilities, which helps to drive collaborative activity.
- The body has positive and mature relationships with stakeholders, where information is shared in an open and transparent way.
- The body recognises and values the contributions that all partners can make.
- The body seeks to establish shared processes and ways of working, where appropriate.

What would show a body is involving people effectively?

- Understanding of who needs to be involved and why.
- Reflecting on how well the needs and challenges facing those people are currently understood.
- Working co-productively, working with stakeholders to design and deliver.
- Seeing the views of stakeholders as a vital source of information that will help deliver better outcomes.
- Ensuring that the full diversity of stakeholders is represented and they can take part.
- Having mature and trusting relationships with its stakeholders where there is ongoing dialogue and sharing of information in an open and transparent way.
- Ensure stakeholders understand the impact of their contribution.
- Seek feedback from key stakeholders which is used to help learn and improve.

Appendix 3

The Health Board's management response to improvement opportunities

The Health Board's management response will be inserted here. This appendix will form part of the final report to be published on the Wales Audit Office website once the report has been considered by the Board or a relevant board committee.

The Health Board considered our findings at the workshop held in August 2019, and agreed a number of improvement opportunities regarding the Health Board's approach to developing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales. We also identified some improvement opportunities for developing corporate arrangements as set out earlier in this report. The following table ([Exhibit 5](#)) presents the actions that the Health Board has identified in response.

Exhibit 5: management response to opportunities for further action

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
Corporate arrangements	
I1 Ensure Health Board wellbeing objectives reflect the full scope of the seven national wellbeing goals. The Health Board should review its existing wellbeing objectives and explore opportunities to better align its	Action: <ul style="list-style-type: none">In May 2019, a Board Development Session was held to consider how the Health Board could embed the sustainable development principle, and the principles of the Act, throughout the organisation. The Future Generations Commissioner was in attendance and provided some challenges to the organisation in terms of 'How well do the Health Boards wellbeing

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
<p>wellbeing objectives with organisational objectives to help extend their focus.</p>	<p>objectives align with the goals of the Act?’ and ‘How well are we delivering against the wellbeing objectives?’</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In considering the challenges posed by the Commissioner, the Health Board has agreed that it will develop a high-level framework for addressing the requirements of the Act through a systematic approach in planning, reporting and cultural change, across the organisation and into our partner relationships. • The Health Board will review how our wellbeing objectives demonstrate the contribution of our objectives to all seven of those of the Act. If we identify gaps we will consider how we review our wellbeing objectives to close those gaps. • In particular we will consider our objectives in our corporate planning processes and link to our Clinical Services Plan and Integrated Medium Term Plan to embed the SD principle within our service delivery plans. <p>Completion date: July 2020 Responsible officer: Director of Strategy</p>
<p>I2 Ensure the Health Board sets out the steps it is taking to deliver wellbeing objectives. The Health Board should set out the steps it is taking to deliver wellbeing objectives and report the progress towards delivering them.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Through our IMTP, we will set out our plans for delivering our wellbeing objectives. Our progress towards delivering these will be included in our Performance Management Framework. We have recently incorporated Public Health Measures in our Performance Reports, and we will look at new ways of capturing our performance reporting across all service areas, to ensure alignment with the Performance Management Framework once developed. • We will use/develop our wellbeing measures more systematically to identify areas of best practice and target interventions at identified areas of additional support. • We will need to further develop new ways of reporting to incorporate both in our Performance Reports to Board, Annual Report and other documents. • We will ensure that our internal Performance Reviews have a clear focus on how we are all responding to the Act.

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
	<p>Completion date: March 2020</p> <p>Responsible officer: Director of Strategy / Associate Director of Strategy</p>
Long term	
<p>I3 Ensure that strategic decisions and service planning incorporate and take account of the ambitions for green spaces in the Health Board's estate. Incorporate the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project into the Health Board's Strategy, Integrated Medium Term Plan 2020-2023 and supporting Estates Strategy, including the actions to be implemented, timeframe and intended benefits and outcomes.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our Executive Board will lead on aligning our corporate goals with our revised wellbeing objectives. We will scrutinise and challenge our work programmes against the SD principle and five ways of working. In line with our corporate planning processes the Health Board will consider our wellbeing objectives within our corporate planning. This will ensure that the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project links directly to our Clinical Services Plan and Integrated Medium Term Plan (IMTP) to further embed the SD principle within our service delivery plans. • The Health Board is currently developing a sustainability section within its IMTP, which will incorporate relevant actions including Green Infrastructure (Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales) targets and opportunities over the next three years. This will be developed in line with our Estates Strategy (currently in draft) which will include a detailed implementation framework including targets, outcomes and milestones. <p>Completion date: March 2020</p> <p>Responsible officer: Director of Strategy / Chief Operating Officer</p>
<p>I4 Ensure that the Health Board has enough capacity to support implementing the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project at each of the 40 sites. The Health Board should set out the capacity and time commitment required by corporate and</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project brings together a set of multi-disciplinary partners who will work in synergy to enable the project to deliver on its objectives. • A particular feature of this multi-agency approach is the high level of knowledge transfer that is possible, as the project brings together and builds upon, decades of previous work by the project partners. The partners are contributing significant amounts of their own time in match-funding (Swansea University £58,966, the Health Board £134,163) of time to the project. In

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales																		
<p>estates staff against the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales action plan/timetable. This will help to determine whether existing capacity is adequate. Change should be progressive to be manageable within existing capacity.</p>	<p>addition, Natural Resources Wales have committed 44 hours of staff time each year to project delivery. The project itself will employ three members of full-time staff, a Green Infrastructure Officer, Botanical Horticulturist and Project Administrator.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Volunteers will be key to the delivery of the project and they will provide £93,638 match, with a very high level of volunteer involvement expected. Further to this, the Health Board Estates Department has committed to matched funding (in hours worked) for the project as follows: <table> <tr> <th>Job Role</th><th>Hours per week</th></tr> <tr> <td>Technical Services Manager</td><td>3.5</td></tr> <tr> <td>Operations Manager Estates</td><td>2.0</td></tr> <tr> <td>Estates Officer Morriston</td><td>2.0</td></tr> <tr> <td>Estates staff</td><td>10.5</td></tr> <tr> <td>Estates supervisor</td><td>2.0</td></tr> <tr> <td>Assistant Director of Strategy</td><td>0.5</td></tr> <tr> <td>Estates Manager Morriston</td><td>0.5</td></tr> <tr> <td>Gardener's (x7)</td><td>52</td></tr> </table> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Time sheets are being completed monthly, which will be monitored against the project plan/milestones on a regular basis to determine capacity and demand needs. This will be reviewed by the Estates Department on a regular basis. Should an increase in capacity be required the Estates Department/Senior Management will review options to create additional resources to support the project. <p>Completion date: July 2020 Responsible officer: Chief Operating Officer</p>	Job Role	Hours per week	Technical Services Manager	3.5	Operations Manager Estates	2.0	Estates Officer Morriston	2.0	Estates staff	10.5	Estates supervisor	2.0	Assistant Director of Strategy	0.5	Estates Manager Morriston	0.5	Gardener's (x7)	52
Job Role	Hours per week																		
Technical Services Manager	3.5																		
Operations Manager Estates	2.0																		
Estates Officer Morriston	2.0																		
Estates staff	10.5																		
Estates supervisor	2.0																		
Assistant Director of Strategy	0.5																		
Estates Manager Morriston	0.5																		
Gardener's (x7)	52																		

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
Prevention	
<p>I5 Ensure that the Health Board has arrangements to monitor that intended outcomes are achieved for staff, patients and service users. The Health Board should determine how it will evaluate the impact on the health and wellbeing of staff, patients and service users and ensure that that individual sites achieve the best outcomes for users.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In line with outcomes and benefits outlined in the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project's Delivery Plan, an Outcomes Framework will be developed, linked to project objectives. This will include specific measurement tools such as the Warwick-Edinburgh Mental Wellbeing tool to assess mental wellbeing, alongside methods to measure increase in volunteer uptake etc. • Annex A of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project delivery plan sets out detailed arrangements to evaluate the impact on the health and wellbeing of staff, patients and service users. <p>Completion date: July 2020 Responsible officer: Chief Operating Officer</p>
Integration	
<p>I6 Ensure that opportunities to work with local authorities and other partners are fully optimised:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • engage with local authorities to identify where green spaces developed separately by local authorities and the Health Board can achieve synergy; and • identify all opportunities to share learning with local authorities. 	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Health Board are statutory partners of both Swansea and Neath Port Talbot Public Service Boards (PSBs). Each has a green wellbeing objective, Swansea PSB 'Working with Nature, and Neath Port Talbot PSB 'Green Infrastructure', with the Health Board being an active member of both locality sub-groups, alongside both local authorities, Natural Resources Wales, fire and rescue services and various third sector organisations. • This collaborative approach ensures that partner organisations are kept up to date with progress, developments and issues. The Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project is a regular agenda item at both meetings. The sharing of information in this way allows partners and other organisations to gain knowledge and understanding of The Biophilic Wales project, as well as establishing links with other projects enabling collaborative delivery and synergy.

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project will be a standing agenda item at bi-monthly PSB sub-group meetings throughout the project lifecycle, which will enable the project to link with similar work streams as and when. Engagement is focal point of the Swansea bay Biophilic Wales project particularly with local authorities and local community groups. A Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project Launch event is currently being scheduled between all of the successful enabling natural resources and wellbeing funded projects. This will provide a national networking opportunity for the Health Board and its partners, providing further opportunities for collaboration on a regional and national level. <p>Completion date: March 2022 Responsible officer: Chief Operating Officer</p>
Collaboration	
<p>17 Ensure that the Health Board explores all opportunities to involve wider staff expertise to inform and contribute to Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales. The Health Board should determine how it will involve wider staff groups in the project to provide expertise in engagement, patient liaison, improving wellbeing, survey design and volunteer engagement.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As agreed in the funding proposal and delivery plan, the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project will be managed in structured stages using project management methodologies, with key deliverables defined for each stage. The project will be governed by a Partnership Group comprised of individuals from each of the main partner organizations, which is scheduled to meet monthly. On a quarterly basis, there will be an 'all partners' meeting, with all project partners invited and additional collaborators will join, depending on the activities being covered. As part of the project's stakeholder mapping exercise, the Health Board will identify staff representatives as part of the project team to provide multi-disciplinary expertise at all levels including patient engagement and patient experience staff. The project work packages will be drafted to outline and agree any deliverables for teams within Natural Resources Wales. There will also be a need for technical meetings to manage particular aspects of the project, for example. meetings about planning seed collection for the year, or the development of

Opportunities for further action	Actions, responsibilities, timescales
	<p>green infrastructure work. The relevant project partners will attend these technical meetings as required.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> As part of its agreed project delivery plan, the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project will develop a Green Infrastructure strategy and action plan for 40 sites within the Health Board's estate. <p>Completion date: March 2020 Responsible officer: Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales Project Manager</p>
Involvement	
<p>I8 Ensure that the Health Board informs engagement plans developed for Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales. The Health Board should determine how it will involve wider groups in the design and development of the 40 site plans, including staff, patients and their families, service users, existing volunteer groups and other organisations that could contribute.</p>	<p>Action:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Health Board will ensure collaboration and engagement with the wider stakeholder group through the development of an Engagement Strategy, which will be developed by Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project team. This will be developed in line with co-production values. Annex A of the Swansea Bay Biophilic Wales project delivery plan sets out detailed planned engagement activities such as; organising ten events per year of the project within the Health Board to engage with the public. Further to this newsletters, blogs and media coverage will be developed throughout the project to promote the principles of green infrastructure development. <p>Completion date: July 2020 Responsible officer: Chief Operating Officer</p>

We will monitor the Health Board's progress in implementing these actions, and the extent to which they address the issues we have identified in our findings, through our future programmes of work.

Wales Audit Office
24 Cathedral Road
Cardiff CF11 9LJ

Tel: 029 2032 0500
Fax: 029 2032 0600
Textphone: 029 2032 0660

E-mail: info@audit.wales
Website: www.audit.wales

Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru
24 Heol y Gadeirlan
Caerdydd CF11 9LJ

Ffôn: 029 2032 0500
Ffacs: 029 2032 0600
Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660

E-bost: post@archwilio.cymru
Gwefan: www.archwilio.cymru